Recommendations following NBSCCCI audit of the missionary congregation of the Holy Ghost Fathers or Spiritans.

By

Mark Vincent Healy
# Table of Contents

**Introduction** ......................................................................................................................... 3  
  What’s it all about? .................................................................................................................. 4  
  The NBSCCCI audit of the Holy Ghost Fathers ................................................................. 5

**Reaching out to victims and their families** ............................................................................. 6  
  What is clerical child sexual abuse? ....................................................................................... 7  
  Who are the victims? ............................................................................................................. 10  
  Who are the perpetrators? ..................................................................................................... 11  
  Who are the facilitators? ....................................................................................................... 13  
  An Example of Facilitation ................................................................................................... 14  
  Irish law as I understand it .................................................................................................. 16

**Review recommendations** .................................................................................................. 17  
  Review Recommendations (to be as specific as possible) .................................................. 17  
    Changes to National Board for Safeguarding Children ..................................................... 17  
    Overhaul Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Catholic Church ................................. 18  
    Improve support services to vulnerable audit subjects .................................................... 19  
    Set standards in public notice of audit nationally and internationally ............................ 20  
    Recording Guidance ........................................................................................................ 21  
    Non-procedural Observations and Recommendations .................................................. 22

**Appendix 1** .......................................................................................................................... 25
  Definition of Child Sexual Abuse ......................................................................................... 25

**Appendix 2** .......................................................................................................................... 26
  Service Records of CSSp Members ...................................................................................... 26

**Appendix 3** .......................................................................................................................... 27
  Religious order denies claim by abuse victim ..................................................................... 27

**Appendix 4** .......................................................................................................................... 29
  CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE - Framework for a Church Response ......................................... 29

**Appendix 5** .......................................................................................................................... 30
  Towards Healing – (http://www.cori.ie/faoiseamh)........................................................... 30

**Appendix 6** .......................................................................................................................... 33
  Towards Healing unveils report ......................................................................................... 33

**Appendix 7** .......................................................................................................................... 36
  Recommendations on issuing a Notice of an NBSCCCI audit ....................................... 36

**Appendix 8** .......................................................................................................................... 39
  VIVAT International .......................................................................................................... 39
**Introduction**

This national audit says it is not about individual cases but on the contrary it is about individual cases which collectively portray such pain and suffering, violation and indignity, abandonment and connivance that was inflicted upon so many children in the trusted care of the Holy Ghost Fathers.

I am very aware from my own situation that there are always three groups of respondents to a principle, argument or issue - those who are 'for', 'against' and 'abstain'. The opinions, actions or omissions show the position held which must be respected no matter if that constitutes reticence, reserve or rejection. It was Edmund Burke (1729 – 1797), an Irish political philosopher, conservative politician and statesman who is accredited with saying,

"**All that is necessary for the triumph of evil is that good men do nothing.**"

What is necessary is a healthy level of conscience to exist in a person disgusted at the nature and contempt for such violations of a defenceless child coerced, intimidated and bullied into such an invidious position which sadly they feel somehow responsible for and guilty of. In my own case I applied the axiom 'only bad things happen to bad boys' so I must have been very bad. Not talking of it, I tried to make it go away. It never did. It never does.

Evil is a term used to describe malicious or pernicious actions or omissions that involves the deliberate violation of mores, ethics or morals. The sexual abuse of defenceless children is beyond doubt the very definition and example of the nature of evil and all who are virtuous will have no argument with denouncing such violations against the child. It is the measure of a society how they protect and foster the most noble life values in their most precious and vulnerable members - their children. Doing nothing is not an option if evil must fail.

Evil against the child is evil against society. A society who is against itself on this matter will be desolate and will be prey to the consequences of the level of evil permitted. This is a human issue at the core of who we are. We must support victims with every moral fibre in our being and in doing so stay the spread of evil and stand for all that is good in the human spirit and cherish our society united against such evil.

The national audit report will be part of a picture and may not go far enough in terms of the scandal caused for some. I am satisfied that any work to highlight the nature of this evil will not allow it to flourish. Evil wants good men to do nothing enticing them with gifts of self-preservation and good reputation but the price will have to be paid for those gifts. It was with the lives of children those gifts were purchased for an unconscionable life in having done nothing.
Good appears as very fragile and wondrous to behold. I have cried bitter tears as my life was pulled asunder in fighting this cause. Friends long tired of this fight in my life look for fresh entertainment whilst I beat the same tune for dignity, justice and compassion these long years. It’s been hard to stay the course but I believe what I am doing is for the good.

In the course of my quest for truth I came across a father who disbelieved his son when he was a boy some 40 years ago. The father was only recently presented with the proof of that boy’s story. A father in bitter tears asked his son to forgive him whom of course he did and a sacred bond between father and son was restored and good which appeared fragile was restored.

The proof provided was from my own case successfully prosecuted by the DPP in the Irish criminal courts. The father and son are from Sierra Leone in West Africa thousands of miles away (7,423.5 km to be exact) whom I have never met. Good that appears fragile stretched so far and is wondrous to behold.

The more I follow this fragile good the more precarious my situation becomes but I cannot abandon what I have been captured by for the good that is fragile and wondrous to behold. My thanks to so many who have been brave enough to join the cause, come forward and lend support each in their own way.

**What’s it all about?**

It is about lifting the veil to shine a light into the darkness of:

- the scale of clerical child sexual abuse nationally and internationally
- the leadership pursuit of preserving name and reputation and schools over the care for young children sexually abused by religious
- the growing evidence which suggests that clerical child sexual abuse is clearly linked with the premature death of victims of clerical child sexual abuse\(^1\)
- the need to find and provide hope and safety for the survivors of clerical child sexual abuse
- the need to guide rescue services, missions and ministry to those abused from childhood and abandoned repeatedly by self-congratulatory and inadequate responses\(^2\) to the crisis and scandal
- the need to console and support those violated and betrayed lives of victims and their families in Ireland and overseas of clerical child sexual abuse with ‘dignity, justice and compassion’
- the need not to forget the indignity, injustice and abandoned experiences borne and suffered by victims and their families who have died.

---

1. *Australian Broadcasting Corporation – Four Corners production of “Unholy Silence” aired 2nd July 2012*
2. “Towards Healing” is not an ‘adequate’ response service. It’s far too superficial for the measures required
Let the children who survive experience the joy of ‘dignity, justice and compassion’ whether they have come forward with bravery and courage or need all the more our love and compassion in not being strong enough. It is not for victims to be burdened by guilt. That weight belongs to the Holy Ghost Fathers.

Let the veil be lifted for the necessary good and life that comes by truth.

**The NBSCCCI audit of the Holy Ghost Fathers**

These inquiries that the NBSCCCI are conducting are a burden no matter what way one looks at them. I engage with that burden so that the burden I and other victims and their families carry might be lessened in moving forward in review of policy, procedures and practices currently in place.

I, like many others, would like to see changes in the terms and scope of this audit that would extend to those abused and their families that which the Papal Legate, Cardinal Marc Ouellet recently advocated in a letter to me: “victims and their families deserve to be treated always with dignity, justice and compassion”.

Such national audits carry a burden of authenticity, impartiality and validity.

They also appear immediately on the international stage as a statement of ‘dignity, justice and compassion’ extended to those as children sexually abuse by the most trusted of groups in our society, the religious. The human family is looking on at such deliberations, looking for hope. Getting it right in handling these matters and national audits has an importance that cannot be overstated in platitudes or clichés.

In the following I hope I can do justice to those victims and their families who were able to confide in me for the purposes of being heard in the burdens they carry perpetually so that changes may be affected for the good of others in lessons learnt and in the manner in which victims and their families are treated.

I do not limit of my response to this audit in the following observations and recommendations which might improve audits and provisions to victims and their families. It is only from a victim-centric perspective can the needs be assessed and addressed. In this regard there is an obvious failure to review as works in progress with victims and their families as all too often action is taken as a fait accompli on policy, practice and procedures which fail the intended target.

Areas I was asked to consider:

1. Reaching out to victims and their families and how to provide for them.
2. Review recommendations to be as specific as they can be in that regard.
Reaching out to victims and their families

I would like to address this primarily as fulfilment of three core values or principles which must underline this very sensitive stage in any audit that “victims and their families deserve to be treated always with dignity, justice and compassion”.

In order to address this matter I lay out my views of clerical child sexual abuse and my definitions of victims, perpetrators and facilitators.

Reaching out to victims and their families with a ‘rescue service’ to seek and find the survivors and bring them into ‘safe space provisioning’ across a number of interrelated dedicated support services from the horrendous experiences and burdens of clerical child sexual abuse is what is called for.

I would be glad to work with you in order to work out a way forward in the provision by the Catholic Church of the pastoral care very much needed and required as part of the ministry to which the clergy were ordained as ministers.

It would involve understanding the spiritual damage caused in an in-depth way and would have to form part of any personal ministry to victims. The greatest damage caused by the Catholic Church hierarchy in this matter has to be the spiritual death of the victims which sadly in many cases lead to their untimely early physical death. Such child victims must be remembered and not be allowed to be faceless and nameless of such crimes against them by a clergy who should have been their protector.

I specifically wish to mention Paul Daly whose case was conjoined with mine in 2009 in its successful criminal prosecution. His tragic life and premature death traces itself back to the trauma and distress caused in his childhood from child sexual abuse committed by a member of the Holy Ghost Fathers. It is particularly sad that he should lose his life during this national audit of the very organisation which failed him so badly as a child. Perhaps the findings might have brought some comfort but that is not to be. Paul Daly must not be forgotten and will not be.

Injustice must not be seen to win the day making crime pay because justice was to hard to win. My research on criminal prosecution confirms that there is little serious consequence to the crime of clerical child sexual abuse. Not one convicted member of the Holy Ghost Fathers has been laicised. My research on compensation shows that there is little serious consequence to the crime of clerical child sexual abuse. The congregation suffers little loss in terms of their profit over decades traded in their ‘good name and reputation’ bought by children sexually abused by members of the congregation.
What is clerical child sexual abuse?

Child sexual abuse is defined as the criminal action which “occurs when a child is used by another person for his or her gratification or sexual arousal or that of others”\(^3\), according to this audit.

Therefore clerical child sexual abuse is the above criminal act committed by a member of the religious community on a child.

Examples of said criminal acts by a priest would be:

- the exposure of his sexual organs or performance of any sexual act intentionally performed in the presence of a child;
- intentionally touching or molesting a child by person or object for the purposes of sexual arousal or gratification of the priest;
- masturbation by the priest of himself or the involvement of a child in an act of masturbation;
- sexual intercourse with a child whether oral, vaginal or anal by the priest;
- and finally sexual exploitation of a child by a priest which includes solicitation, recording of sexually explicit material or showing sexually explicit material to a child identified as a feature of the ‘grooming’ process by perpetrators of clerical child sexual abuse.

Sometimes seen as a prurient public interest, the criminal act of child sexual abuse is equated with degree of impact or damage. This a false assumption despite public perceptions held.

Each victim experiences and is damaged in different ways some more profoundly than others. That damage is personal in spiritual, mental, physical and social dimensions. The most profound of these is the spiritual dimension. When I use the term spiritual I do not mean ‘faith’ though that is very much part of a structure or framework adopted or not by any individual to their spiritual life.

Spiritual life is the internal dialogue with self and the world of experience through the unique gift of one’s abilities to interpret those experiences.

When a child is sexually abused by a priest a whole raft of developing spiritual gifts are damaged. It is as though the child gifted with a beautiful home inside

\(^3\) The definition was originally proposed by the Western Australia Task Force on Child Sexual Abuse, 1987 and is adopted by the Law Reform Commission (1990) Report on Child Sexual Abuse, p.8.
them has had some of those developing gifts destroyed and damaged in any number of ways. Their life of dysfunction begins on their own and alone.

The very first consequence of sexual abuse on a child by a priest is alienation which builds to isolation and attaches to senses and beliefs of abandonment and resentment in not having been spared or saved from it. In that belief there is the guilt it was somehow their fault which silences the victim from calling out for help to their parents or protectors. It leads to sullen preoccupations with a world not to be trusted. A change of behaviour is noted but not understood.

It leads to self-abuse, self-recrimination, self-loathing, self-harming or needing to be overly self-reliant. The dysfunctional response and damping of the trauma by the child leads to self-coping mechanisms and dependencies that invariably are very destructive. For some that may unfortunately lead to alcohol or drug abuse where the latter can lead to a life of financial distresses which encourage crime in order to feed the habit and the former is well known unfortunately to too many Irish families. For others like me the consequences of clerical sexual abuse leads to sexual developmental issues which are quite dysfunctional, self-abusive and self-harming. I don’t engage with anyone in that respect after a life of sexual dysfunction. I have no interest in pursuing what is too painful for me, an intimate and personal relationship with another person. I live a very solitary life but try where I can to ensure others can get the help they need to cope and survive or are spared what I have had to endure and continue to endure.

That home inside the child with all its developing gifts never flourishes as it was originally intended and one is left wondering what life would have been like without such destruction and permanent distress. It is an agonising question because it can never really be fully answered though educated conjecture would indicate a far better life would certainly have been enjoyed, it can never really be known what potential was lost on so many levels.

It is for these and other reasons which time doesn’t permit that the impact and consequences of clerical child sexual abuse as understood by the Catholic Church can have varying but always pronounced affect not only on victims but their families. I spoke with one of the authors and contributors of “CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE - Framework for a Church Response”, Dr. Patrick Walsh former director of Psychological Services, St John of God’s Order, who confirmed the many areas of impact expressed in the document from a psychiatric point of view were well known and the findings based on sound research found in American journals of psychiatry before its publication in 1996. What was startling about the psychiatric references has been how the legal representatives of clerical abusers seem to have great difficulty in accepting the learned

findings of those who are their betters in that field of science. It was found that, “the negative impact of sexual abuse on children should never be underestimated or minimised” but is constantly being minimised by legal representatives for the religious. It goes on to state the long-lasting impacts of clerical child sexual abuse. There is a marked absence of such clarity in all subsequent documentation by the Catholic Church on impact and effects on victims.

There is no cure for a broken life suffering such protracted pain and damage; there is at best learning to cope with the losses and needing to be watched over by lifelong safe space provisioning.

Crucial in addressing the complexities of clerical child sexual abuse is the understanding of who are the victims and perpetrators around whom certain false cultures have grown, spawned by the nature of scandal. In order to understand the truth of scandal, where truth is in short supply, I think it is imperative to address the last group which I need to define, the facilitators within the Holy Ghost Fathers.

---

Who are the victims?

One could answer that and say we are all the victims of clerical child sexual abuse in terms of its consequences which affects the whole human family and there would be more understanding in taking that stance and comprehending the enormity of what one is dealing with if one adopted such a perspective.

In lieu of a composite report I received a verbal broad outline of the findings of the audit review which defined the review as identifying two categories of victims. One category was those who had been known through previous allegations or legal confrontations whether criminally or civilly. The second category was those who had come forward for the first time through the audit process whether as victims in Ireland or from overseas in Africa and elsewhere.

There were at least three main categories of victim not mentioned or identified in the verbal composite audit report but were implied.

Firstly and most tragically there was no mention or identification of those who had died from the long suffering of their sexual abuse as children and had ended their lives in a protracted suicide and premature death. The connection between premature death and suicide and clerical child sexual abuse is finally gaining currency and is changing the way police forces are now reviewing suicides or unnatural deaths from self-abuse. Far too little observation or focus has been placed on this dark secret which must not be allowed to persist.

Secondly there was no mention or identification of unknown cases save to say that it was assumed that there were a large number of cases which would not have been known to the auditors. The audit became aware of approximately 140-150 or more victims of clerical child sexual abuse by approximately 46-49 members of the Holy Ghost Fathers. This equates to a 3 to 1 ratio of victims to perpetrators which by any standards clearly indicated that there are indeed a much larger volume of unknown cases of clerical child sexual abuse unknown after this audit.

It gives urgency and point to my calls for a ‘rescue service’ which includes a far more robust ‘safe space provisioning service’ than that provided by the Catholic Church’s global response “Towards Healing” counselling services.

Thirdly, the families of victims are not identified as victims of this scandal also. Again there is clear evidence to show that families are profoundly affected by clerical child sexual abuse across the generations. Parents who remain with so

---

6 The State Government of Victoria Australia was pressured into holding the inquiry after the release of a police report that criticised the Catholic Church’s handling of abuse issues. The confidential police report revealed that the Church had known about a shockingly high rate of suicides and premature deaths but had “chosen to remain silent”. There is a growing demand for a Federal national inquiry in Australia.
much guilt with thoughts of failing their children; or like siblings who were faced with overwhelming burdens feel impotent to respond effectively; or the children of those abused who are robbed of a healthy untraumatised father or mother of such abuse.

The single most direct route of seeking justice is laid out through legal procedures for victims but families have no recourse to redress either criminally or civilly. Whilst a litigious route is in fact just another abuse and injustice to victims in practice for the most part, a point I will return to, it is, for all its failings, a matter of solace and consolation to endure if only for justice to be seen to be done when in fact it is not.

I believe a parent should have a right to be heard and seek justice especially as they are obligated by Irish law to relinquish their child into the trust and care of schools as provided for and under the penalties and sanctions provided for in the Schools Attendance Act 1926 which were imposed on parents who failed to ensure their children attended school up to and including fines and or imprisonment.

There is something inherently wrong with such an imbalance of responsibility on parents who are denied any access to justice against those they were forced by law to entrust with the care of their child. Therefore a wider definition of victim is required in such audits and any inquiries that should be conducted in offering relief to those of just cause.

**Who are the perpetrators?**

If I have tried to define who are the victims I should turn to try to define the perpetrators of clerical child sexual abuse.

Firstly it must be noted that not all perpetrators of clerical child sexual abuse by members of the Holy Ghost Fathers are held accountable for their criminal actions. This can be a great source of further distress to victims and their families even where it is followed by some compensation offering which bears little resemblance to the actual restitution required. The strange act of offering compensation to a victim of a failed criminal prosecution makes no sense if only as an acknowledgement of some guilt and liability to a genuine victim.

Secondly despite the criminal conviction of some members of the Holy Ghost Fathers in Irish courts such as Fr. Augustine Gus Griffin C.S.Sp. in July 1998 or Fr. Henry F. Moloney C.S.Sp. in April 2009 for the second time not one of those convicted were ever laicised or defrocked by the Holy Ghost Fathers.
Their honoured status as “Reverend” or “Father” is completely out of order for the convictions they hold for clerical child sexual abuse. In the verbal composite report this was also mentioned as totally inexplicable if not indefensible. There can be no reason for not laicising or defrocking convicted priests of the Holy Ghost Fathers.

There is evidence to show that the Holy Ghost Fathers were using Kimmage Manor in Dublin and Ardbraccan in Navan as reprocessing centres of known, alleged and convicted offenders of clerical child sexual abuse. A well thought out programme needs to be worked out for the laicising of members of the Holy Ghost Fathers including reprocessing. I am aware that such reprocessing or rehabilitation is very difficult from reports by the Servants of the Paraclete dedicated to such work since 1947 but there is an urgent need to set up ‘safe space provisioning’ sponsored by the congregation for laicised members.

As with victims the periphery of the perpetrator’s world is the seduction of despair and suicide. You cannot rehabilitate a dead perpetrator no more than you can console a family of a dead victim.

Where ‘safe space provisions’ can be set up for both victims and perpetrators there may be the potential for a ‘truth and reconciliation’ program or ‘restorative justice’ program where victims and their families may be able to face their abusers in finding some consolation and peace in the act of apology and forgiveness. The latter is I think vital where possible for the victims and their families to find peace and let go the anger and revenge feelings of what is essentially the act of self-love for the pain inside. The former is I think vital for perpetrators if they are ever to comprehend the enormity of their selfish and lustful act on a child who did not know or understand such actions by a priest.

I’m not sure ‘restorative justice’ is possible because of the gap between victim and perpetrator under the current system. Perpetrators show little comprehension of their abuse. Victims are given so little truth and are constantly betrayed by those managing the scandal and crisis. The situation and scandal is self-perpetuating where victims and managers are not in dialogue and the only means of redress is through civil authorities that are not guided by any moral principle but the rules of litigation which demand denial (criminal) and diminishment (civil) as basic defences.

When speaking with Cardinal Marc Ouellet, Papal Legate to the International Eucharistic Congress in Dublin8, I raised the moral imperative that litigious means forced upon victims is an injustice in itself and the more so in Ireland where prompt and public trial is not guaranteed as in the 6th Amendment of the American Constitution. I stated that the very protraction of redress is an

---

8 50th International Eucharistic Congress, 10th – 17th June 2012, in Dublin, Ireland.
unbearable injustice to Irish victims of clerical child sexual abuse. He agreed. I stated that any false argument made by a senior counsel representing the Holy Ghost Fathers in an Irish court of law was an injustice and abomination for which I held the Holy Ghost Fathers responsible, for they are the beneficiaries of the false argument and statement. He agreed. In the absence of any other means of seeking justice I would be asking that pressure is brought to bear on the judicial system to ensure prompt and public trial of all civil cases of clerical child sexual abuse. I would also ask that far greater care and notice is made regarding legal argument under their code of ‘deny and diminish’ to one of moral culpability by the Defendants representatives in the Irish courts especially in criminal cases involving child victims.

A total change is needed predicated on a complete change of heart by the managers of the scandal and crisis to set up rescue services seeking those who are victims and providing far more realistic safe space provisioning to them and their families.

The nature of the abuse is not like a wound which can be healed leaving at most a superficial scar. It is a lifelong disability where the victims are constantly reminded of the affects, distresses and losses. In physical terms victims of clerical child sexual abuse have damaged limbs which may be helped with prosthetics and improved but the work is constant and lifelong to enable and improve the quality of life for the lost limbs. ‘Restorative justice’ has to be defined in the present continuous. All too often those who come forward are horrendously denied any real justice and what is meted out to them finishes with any financial restitution made. It is truly appalling. Whilst I fully advocate proper financial restitution is made as a moral obligation, the managers of the scandal and crisis need to follow up with a constant vigilance and watch on those who were abused. Failure to do so is beginning to reveal a far more sinister outcome of dysfunctional life and premature death of victims.

**Who are the facilitators?**

These include those who were drawn into the scandal and who, for fear of its power to destroy the reputation of the schools and congregation, made fateful decisions which were not only to have profound affect on the lives of those victims and their families in the past but were responsible for migrating the distress and devastation to so many more lives in Africa and overseas thus prolonging the suffering of those already abused as children and spreading the abuse to unsuspecting children and their families overseas.

Scandal tempts, what all too often appears as collusion, concealment or the lack of co-operation, desperate efforts at self-preservation over compassion for victims and their families. Sadly I am not talking appearances but reality in this respect of the evidence found.
In carrying out a review of the Holy Ghost Fathers service records and conducting interviews by way of telephone conversations, I found out some startling revelations regarding facilitation of clerical child sexual abuse but most shockingly the disregard of Irish children abused and the reckless endangerment of other children overseas in Africa through concealment of their knowledge of the sexual abuse of boys through complaints raised by parents. This was achieved by Holy Ghost Fathers’ facilitation of criminals to evade and escape justice in Ireland by engaging senior leadership of the congregation in support of such reprehensible actions and serious dereliction, if not criminal dereliction, of a duty of care to children as young as eight years old in their trusted care.

**An Example of Facilitation**

I found that in 1980 Rev Henry Moloney (currently of Kimmage Manor not laicised or defrocked despite multiple criminal convictions) returned to Ireland from Sierra Leone and was appointed to Blackrock College upon his return during the reign of Rev Enda Watters as Irish Provincial who currently resides at Kimmage Manor.

The former Principal and President of St. Mary’s College Rev James Hurley (currently of Rockwell College) who sought Moloney’s transfer out of Ireland in 1973 to Sierra Leone was also appointed to Blackrock College from 1978 – 1980. In other words Hurley received Moloney back whom he had known to have sexually abused boys in St Mary’s College from 1968 – 1973. He also cared not to know if boys were going to be sexually abused in Christ the King College in Sierra Leone, the boys’ school to which Rev Henry Moloney was transferred from his criminal sexual predation of boys in St. Mary’s College up to 1973.

What was Moloney even doing in another boys’ school, doing in Blackrock College in 1980? It gets worse. Hurley and Moloney both transfer to Rockwell College in 1981 and remain at least until 1992. In 1992 Rev James Hurley is made Superior and Principal of Rockwell College.

No attempt is made to keep Moloney from having access to children though he was noted and has been accepted to have been sexually abusing boys from as early as 1973 officially at management level though many suspect it was known long before that. Certainly students of St Mary’s College hold that the management knew full well about the sexual predation and proclivity of Rev Henry Moloney towards boys in the school but did nothing about it. I and many others could have been spared his abuse if action had only been taken earlier.
By 1981 he had left a wake of devastation in St. Mary’s College, Christ the King College in Sierra Leone and as yet unknown devastation distress in Blackrock College and Rockwell College.

High Court Search records indicate such abuses did take place but I have to tie down Rockwell leads which remain unconfirmed as allegations raised and if those cases were successfully prosecuted in civil or criminal terms.

What has been discovered in the Moloney and Hurley link is that higher office was involved in the story up to Superior General level where Hurley had to obtain support for the transfer of Moloney to Sierra Leone through the Irish Provincial, Rev Christy O’Brien† (deceased) transferring out of Ireland in 1973 to escape justice and the Irish Provincial, Rev Enda Watters (currently of Kimmage Manor) receiving Moloney back to Ireland in 1980 after his devastating stay in Sierra Leone to schoolboys there.

Rev James Hurley at the time was appointed as ‘Councillor for Education’ (1978-1980) holding such a position in the Provincialate Office (address at Cypress Grove North, Templeogue, D6, at the time) and at Blackrock College he was simultaneously appointed as ‘Education Councillor’. Hurley held the position, place and authority to object to the appointment of a known clerical child sexual abuser but did nothing. It looks as though Hurley facilitated not only Moloney’s criminal escape from justice but also his return to this country when those complainants were out of the way from 1973 in St Mary’s College.

The manner in which perpetrators were facilitated and children recklessly endangered was not confined to this case. In the attached Service Records of CSSp Members it should be noted that precedence in the reprehensible handling and facilitation of those uncontested and fully believed cases of clerical child sexual abuse by members of the Holy Ghost Fathers was conducted with the full backing and support of senior heads or superiors of the congregation. In terms of the command structure and leadership of the organisation these matters would have to have been known at the very top by the Superior Generals of the Holy Ghost Fathers resident in Rome.

The case of Rev Arthur Carragher† (died 10 January 2011) was a case in point. Complaints raised by a parent led to Carragher’s transfer out of St. Mary’s College to Ontario, Canada where he arrived on the 15th June 1971. No consideration was given by the President/Principal at the time, Rev James Hurley, to any of the boys that Carragher had sexually abused in St Mary’s. He left a trail of devastation behind him for the brief time he had been appointed to St. Mary’s College after 17 years in Nigeria. Denial or obfuscation has been one of the hallmark characteristics in the handling of these issues – see Appendix 3.

---

9 Appendix 2 – Service Records of CSSp Members shows the location of members from 1950 onwards
10 Appendix 3 – Irish Times news article by Patsy McGarry – “Religious order denies claim by abuse victim”
Irish law as I understand it

The Criminal Justice Act 1997 Section 15 basically granted an amnesty to all offences for the “crime of misprision of felony” prior to its enactment. It was replaced with Section 7(2) of the new Act where any action which impedes the apprehension or prosecution of a known offense (punishable by five years or more of imprisonment) or Section 8 withholding information ‘compounding a felony’ for a financial imbursement knowing it is a felony punishable by five years or more of imprisonment.

The only moot point which might bear fruit is where it might be argued that some facilitators amongst the leadership did just that, intended to impede any prosecution by moving perpetrators outside Irish jurisdiction, for instance. However my reading of the information on the Criminal Justice Act 1997 is that this would not be successful because both Section 7(2) and 8 only applies to acts committed after 1997 and not before.

The amnesty provision in Section 15 erases all culpability for the “crime of misprision of felony” and Sections 7(2) and 8 do not apply retrospectively placing a nail in the coffin on any form of redress prior to 1997 for the “crime of misprision of felony” or breaches of Sections 7(2) and 8 of the Criminal Justice Act 1997.

What a happy day in 1997 for serious crimes committed which were punishable by five years of more of imprisonment prior to 1997. The clergy amongst others must have popped a few corks that day considering the attention clerical child sexual abuse already received to that date. It makes an ass of the law and the disingenuous publication of the framework document of 199611.

Considering all law must service justice. The statute of limitations was repealed in cases of child sexual abuse for two reasons. Firstly the victims involved are recognised to have been minors at the time of the offences and far too vulnerable disadvantaging them significantly from receiving relief. And secondly, coming forward in seeking justice was clearly identified as also a serious disadvantage to victims of those crimes. If the law can be changed to retrospectively permit such victims access to justice by repealing any statute of limitations against their perpetrators then it must be argued that the same reasoning must apply to access in repealing any statute of limitations on their facilitators.

Crime does not take place in a vacuum but an environment. What has become all too clear is that scandal enticed good men to evil actions of wilful misprision to the advantage of the congregation in question and disadvantage of children.

---

Review recommendations

Early on when I wished to publicise notice of the NBSCCCI audit to victims and their families around the world I asked if there was a pack of information which I could send out regarding an audit. I suggested that the pack should include: an explanation of the audit; how to participate and contribute in writing or verbally; where contributors could obtain help with the consequences of engaging with such devastating memories and currently, as in many cases, distressing traumas; and finally any legal assistance or general advice.

I include reference to the likes of mental health services offered by “Towards Healing” born out of the former Faoiseamh organisation. It is by no means the sort of provisions that I feel are required but they are a step in the right direction for victims and their families offering global support services which is exactly what the audit of missionary congregations requires – see Appendix 512 and Appendix 613.

My understanding and campaign is far more comprehensive for victims and their families as I believe the current systems fail victims and their families. I would like to see ‘safe space provisioning’ on four interrelated levels of rescue some of which must remain in service to victims and their families for their lifetime. I am alone in advocating ‘rescue services’ which suggests going out and finding those in great distress as both a civil and moral obligation I place squarely upon the religious life.

I find some of my ideas which I proposed to Faoiseamh are in place with “Towards Healing” but what is of vital importance to the National Board for Safeguarding Children is hooking up with services which meet the needs of audits which clearly require support services to help those victims and their families who are found through the process of audits which span international jurisdictions.

Review Recommendations (to be as specific as possible)

Changes to National Board for Safeguarding Children

Fairness in terms of representation of victims and their families should bring about a major change to the auditing authority’s board members. It has been noted that there is not a survivor representative on the board which would be seen as a very important step forward in validating the Review Report generated by the National Board for Safeguarding Children.

---

12 Appendix 5 - Towards Healing – (http://www.cori.ie/faoiseamh
13 Appendix 6 - Towards Healing unveils report
It was also noted that certain members of the board step aside for any given audit where it has been clearly shown there is a conflict of interests between those under audit and an affiliation with them. It might be time to consider that board members of the NBSCCCI were all lay members, so as to avoid any loss of expertise in conducting audits and reviews due to any conflict of interests. It has also been noticed that certain members of staff such as those responsible for professional standards is a member of the religious life: this appears as a conflict of interests of the religious life judging the religious life.

It was noted that there was a conflict of interests in Fr Ed Grimes C.S.Sp. being on board of NBSCCCI as notable Canon Law expert but also with direct connection with the congregation under scrutiny, the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. He had to step aside for this audit by the NBSCCCI. The timing of Fr Ed Grimes C.S.Sp. stepping aside needs to be clarified as he was not excluded from access to the files and information provided by victims and their families and source files gathered by the NBSCCCI till late in the data gathering process. It was an appalling conflict of interests and injustice to the victims and their families where such information was accessible to a member of the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) congregation under audit review.

**Overhaul Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Catholic Church**

This is a first audit regarding an Irish review of a missionary order. It is a first to be carried out anywhere in the world indeed. I very much welcome it and the fairness in placing a notice of such a review on the Irish Spiritans' website. As a result there is an obvious need to overhaul the current methodology and guidelines in reviewing Safeguarding Practices in the Catholic Church.

I note the following observations which are not limited by any observations included at this time.

The Terms of Reference, Step Guide to the Review Process and Methodology and Procedural Notes should change to reflect the international nature and reach of missionary congregations to both potentially cause and conceal any sexual abuse of children in their care by living or deceased members.

The Data Processing Deed needs to be changed to reflect international data protection and not just comply with national data protection legislation. International data subjects need to be assured their personal data enjoys the same protection, access, control and authentication as national data subjects. One needs to establish the right of the Data Controller to provide or withhold any personal information outside of the European Economic Area.
The Step Guide to the Review Process must change to include all new subject data not held on the Data Controller’s files. New subject data nationally and internationally is likely to occur where proper notice standards are established (discussed later in these recommendations). Steps should be introduced to gather information form new data subjects and their families.

Case file storage needs to be reviewed as there appears to be only one copy or source maintained. Similar security measures can apply to any backup system as the original. Perhaps the backup system should be kept by the Data Commissioner. Concurrency measures will have to be established.

What happens to subject data furnished directly to the data processor? Is that immediately shared with the data controller? A data subject may wish to share information with the data processor but not the data controller.

All case files should have an access log cover sheet. The log sheet should indicate who accessed the case file, when they did, on whose authority they accessed the case file and for what stated purpose. This should assure the data subject that all accesses of their case file were accountably and traceably shared in keeping with the promises stated in the “Case Record Agreement in line with Data Protection Legislation”\(^\text{14}\).

The Schedule for Interviews might also lay out provisions to include victims and their families especially where they are not found on any cross-reference with complaint reports and fieldwork files supplied by the data controller.

**Improve support services to vulnerable audit subjects**

1. Each audit should highlight deficiencies in services to victims and their families where the current support services have failed to reach out to some who are far too vulnerable and unimpressed with options of support. It is strange how the quest for truth brought many forward for the first time so that the truth would be known and still they did not necessarily seek any assistance or engage in legal action. This is a very important observation and shows victims are incredibly brave risking so much in coming forward. What was so shameful was the state of those known already that had been utterly forgotten and uncared for despite clear indications and knowledge of their vulnerability. The death of Paul Daly during this particular audit must bring about immediate change in regard to a watch support service on the vulnerable that become known.

---

\(^{14}\) See Case Recording Section 2 p.21 *Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Catholic Church*
Set standards in public notice of audit nationally and internationally

Issuing a notice of the proposed audit because...

1. Audit policy must include clear indication and statement of intent to permit the widest possible participation and contribution from victims and their families because fieldwork may only reference paperwork and minimal interview procedures where baseline data and information may only be found if additional written and verbal statement, testimony and personal interview is carried out. Appropriate procedures in the gathering of this data must be sympathetic to the contributors and comply with policy intentions.

2. Audit notice is as a beacon to invite victims and their families to contribute and participate so standards must be set regarding any notice. These standards must be clearly established and complied with, and their content should be determined by the auditing authority in agreement with the Bishops Conference, having specific reference to and consultation with representatives for victims and their families.

3. Multiple media streams may be employed for this purpose – national and international newspapers, web services locally and internationally, email shots and snail mail where appropriate. The format and content should carry very specific information which must be legally compliant with data protection standards nationally and internationally. Responses should be handled by trained and qualified staff of the NBSCCCI as the first place of contact in any notice, and again the notice must be sympathetic to the contributors and comply with policy intentions.

4. Global notice standards need to be drawn up, implemented and complied with in the interests of fairness to survivors and their families. Families should be allowed to participate in the audit process through contribution of their stories, and of their experiences of the policy, practices and procedures, past or present, in the handling the safeguarding of children in the care of those under audit.

Wider notice is required for missionary congregations where Irish members of the order have been appointed. The Holy Ghost Fathers being an international congregation with a presence in 53 countries on 5 continents (http://www.spiritan.org/worldwide/index.html), it is important to try to get notice out to as many countries as possible concerning an audit. Appropriate procedures in issuing global notices must be sympathetic to the contributors and comply with policy intentions.

---

15 Appendix 7 - Recommendations on issuing a Notice of an NBSCCCI audit
5. National newspapers should carry publication regarding a notice of audit as standard. I draw attention to the notice placed in the newspapers regarding a mass for the dead in May of the Holy Ghost Fathers to be conducted in Rockwell but where no such notice was made regarding this audit. I make the point because of the urgency and significance of the audit, not to compare an audit with a commemoration of those who have passed away. I show absolutely no disrespect in making note of it. The importance of making significant, sincere and genuine effort in raising public notice of any given audit must be issued with the clear intent of informing those most likely to participate and contribute to such audits. Again this must be sympathetic to the contributors and comply with policy intentions.

6. Change requests to any notice must be dealt with through a complaints procedure that is efficient and effective in its design to ensure rapid and prompt real-time correction. The default position must be to ensure victims and their families are not caused any offence or misled in the provision of any comment or information they provide to an audit. Legal notice of any information gathered or sought must be explained to contributors through any media format especially where such information may be surfacing for the first time with judgement called for and caution issued, and again the change request policy, practice and procedures must be sympathetic to the contributors and comply with policy intentions.

7. Notice of publication of the final audit report should be announced so participants can arrange their diary and participate accordingly.

**Recording Guidance**

1. It was noted that historical case files were not necessarily recorded leading to difficulties in providing accurate details of sexual abuse of children in the care of the Holy Ghost Fathers. It was fortunate that there was sufficient witness testimony available to corroborate complaints raised in the past which otherwise would have placed victims in an invidious position regarding the veracity of their cases.

If there had not been adequate notice in a concerted campaign to raise awareness, essential data would not have been captured in this audit.

All the benefits cited in Section 2 of Recording Guidance in the review procedures would have been forfeit. Additional consideration should therefore be given to extending methodologies to capture as much data as possible to reflect as complete a picture as possible so as to be able to extend the necessary support services to victims and their families.
Non-procedural Observations and Recommendations

1. There are international issues which must be addressed where collusion to conceal the abuse of children in one jurisdiction was inflicted upon another without any consideration for the children in either location.

Review of international standards, diplomatic agreements in permitting the transfer of religious should be reviewed and robust policy, procedures and practices put in place to thwart this often despicable abuse of international privilege accorded to the religious life.

2. Review must be taken on the legal loophole of statute of limitations which should be lifted and agreement sought to remove any limitation on such crimes towards children, making those who perpetrate such crimes and those who facilitate such crimes answerable in a national and even international court of law.

All countries, not just those who are signatories to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child, should sign treaties permitting the extradition of those who committed such heinous criminal acts on children.

3. Review should be sought in Ireland for amendments to Irish law of the Sexual Offences (Jurisdiction) Act, 1996 which would lift any statute of limitation on prosecuting Irish citizens in Ireland for child sexual offences committed in another jurisdiction. This would require a constitutional change to permit specific laws to have a retrospective effect where public interest is better served in terms of justice exercised against those who have committed such certain classes of offence as child sexual abuse.

4. The Holy Ghost Fathers C.S.Sp. is a member of VIVAT International since January 2009 (http://vivatinternational.org/about/membership/) but has obstructed justice in concealing and hiding information on known child sexual abuse by its members, and on how the organisation has facilitated aberrant members of its congregation, and concealed its own actions in facilitating there transfer or failing in bringing them to justice.

For all the good that the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. are attributed with achieving it is appalling that they would cover up so much regarding the sexual abuse of children by their members and make the seeking of justice by those abused children so extremely difficult and an injustice in itself.

16 See Appendix 8 on the vision and mission statement of VIVAT International
I wonder if there is not a clear conflict with respect of any member of **VIVAT International** who has so blatantly concealed so much concerning the sexual abuse of children by its members whilst espousing such laudable support for the suppressed and afflicted. I have sought disciplinary guidelines regarding members of VIVAT International to which the Holy Ghost Fathers were made a full member in January 2009\(^\text{17}\). They have not provided any such guidelines to date.

5. I noted how at the Enlarged General Council meting in Ariccia in 2008\(^\text{18}\) that the Superior General, Fr. Jean-Paul Hoch C.S.Sp. did not make any ‘“Superior General’s Report” describing the present state of the Congregation.’ I would have been interested to read such a report, to see what level of importance their cases of clerical child sexual abuse was given in describing the present state of the congregation – given that there had been 14 civil cases in the Irish Province from 1998 to before the Enlarged General Council in 2008, not to mention more criminal cases. Present at the Enlarged General Council was the Irish Provincial, Fr Brian Starken C.S.Sp., who was fully aware of these matters.

6. The international dimension of addressing the clerical child sexual abuse of children by members of the Holy Ghost Fathers will require more scrutiny. One wonders how many other victims exist if the world wide congregation were to come under audit. An outreach program is required at the very least to rescue survivors and establish safe space provisioning.

7. Requests for memorials at all colleges of clerical child sexual abuse might serve as a reminder of such scale of abuse of children as has been found in this audit, and establish by such reminders a vigilance and commitment to a policy never to allow such to happen again.

8. Mandatory school’s programme on the history of clerical child sexual abuse should be part of the standard curriculum.

\(^{17}\) Congregation of the Holy Spirit – CSSp is a VIVAT member - [http://vivatinternational.org/about/membership/](http://vivatinternational.org/about/membership/)

Appendix 1

“Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Catholic Church” – p.5

Definition of Child Sexual Abuse

The definition of child sexual abuse is in accordance with the definition adopted by the Ferns Report (and the Commission of Investigation Report into the Catholic Archdiocese of Dublin). The following is the relevant extract from the Ferns Report:

“While definitions of child sexual abuse vary according to context, probably the most useful definition and broadest for the purposes of this Report was that which was adopted by the Law Reform Commission in 1990 and later developed in Children First, National Guidelines for the Protection and Welfare of Children (Department of Health and Children, 1999) which state that “child sexual abuse occurs when a child is used by another person for his or her gratification or sexual arousal or that of others”. Examples of child sexual abuse include the following:

- exposure of the sexual organs or any sexual act intentionally performed in the presence of a child;
- intentional touching or molesting of the body of a child whether by person or object for the purpose of sexual arousal or gratification;
- masturbation in the presence of the child or the involvement of the child in an act of masturbation;
- sexual intercourse with the child whether oral, vaginal or anal;
- sexual exploitation of a child which includes inciting, encouraging, propositioning, requiring or permitting a child to solicit for, or to engage in prostitution or other sexual acts. Sexual exploitation also occurs when a child is involved in exhibition, modelling or posing for the purpose of sexual arousal, gratification or sexual act, including its recording (on film, video tape, or other media) or the manipulation for those purposes of the image by computer or other means. It may also include showing sexually explicit material to children which is often a feature of the ‘grooming’ process by perpetrators of abuse.”

19 Definition of child sexual abuse see methodology and guidance document Review of Safeguarding Practice in the Catholic Church produced by National Board for Safeguarding Children (NBSCCCI)

20 This definition was originally proposed by the Western Australia Task Force on Child Sexual Abuse, 1987 and is adopted by the Law Reform Commission (1990) Report on Child Sexual Abuse, p. 8.
### Appendix 2

#### Service Records of CSSp Members

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>First</th>
<th>Middle</th>
<th>Last</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rev Arthur Carraghrip</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Henry F Moloney</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev James J Hurley</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Vincent O'Grady</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Holy Ghost Fathers Irish Provincials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Patrick O'Carroll</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Timothy O'Driscoll</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Vincent J Dinan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Christopher O'Brien</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev William Jenkinson</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Enda Watters</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Michael F McCarthy</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Brian M McLaughlin</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Martin Keane</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Patrick T Palmer</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Brian Starken</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rev Marc Wheelan</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Provinciate Office</th>
<th>cssp</th>
<th>K Holy Spirit Missionary College – Kimmage</th>
<th>N Diocese of Onitsha, Nigeria, W Africa</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Holy Spirit Education Office</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>D Kimmage Development Studies Centre</td>
<td>O Diocese of Owem, Nigeria, W Africa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church of the Holy Spirit – Kimmage</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>B Blackrock College</td>
<td>P Diocese of Port Harcourt, Nigeria, WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church of the Holy Spirit – Templeville</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>M Willow Park</td>
<td>O District of Ontario, Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Church of the Transfiguration</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>X St Michael’s College</td>
<td>M Middleton, Co. Armagh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parish of St Ronan’s</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>Z Templeogue College</td>
<td>S Diocese of Freetown and Bo, Sierra Leone</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Newlands Institute for Counselling</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>H St Mary’s College</td>
<td>K District of Kenya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritan Community</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>R Rockwell College</td>
<td>U Union of Circumscriptions of East Asia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spiritan Missionaries – Ardbraccan Navan</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>M Head Office Rome</td>
<td>B Brazil</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>House of Philosophy – North Circular Road</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>I SPARISI – North Circular Road</td>
<td>M District of Malawi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPIRISI – North Circular Road</td>
<td>cssp</td>
<td>IMU</td>
<td>Z Zanzibar Tanzania East Africa</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Layout and Design Intellectual Property of Mark Vincent Healy
Appendix 3

Religious order denies claim by abuse victim

The Irish Times - Friday, June 3, 2011

Home – Ireland – In The Courts

PATSY McGARRY, Religious Affairs Correspondent

A DUBLIN man has claimed that a missionary congregation did not co-operate with the civil authorities as fully as claimed during an investigation of his alleged abuse by one of its priests in the city. The congregation, however, says it did so.

In 2007 Mark Vincent Healy said he had been abused in Ireland by two Holy Ghost (now known as Spiritans) missionary priests when they were teaching at St Mary’s College, Rathmines, in Dublin.

Aged between nine and 12 at the time, he said the abuse took place between 1969 and 1973 when he was a pupil at the junior and senior schools there.

In March 2009, one of the priests, Fr Henry Maloney, was found guilty in court of abusing Mr Healy and another man when both were pupils at St Mary’s.

The priest was given a suspended sentence due to ill-health as he was already under strict supervision at Kimmage Manor in Dublin.

Fr Maloney, who had been out of ministry and under strict supervision since 1996, had previously been convicted of child abuse in 2000, when he received and served a prison sentence of 18 months.

Ordained in 1967, he taught at St Mary’s between 1968 and 1973, following which he was transferred to Sierra Leone.

The second priest accused by Mr Healy was Fr Arthur Carragher, who died in Canada on January 10th this year. Ordained in 1952, he served in Sierra Leone before joining the teaching staff at St Mary’s in 1969. In June 1971, he went to Canada where he transferred to the congregation’s Trans Canada province.

That move was described this week by Holy Ghost Irish provincial Fr Brian Starken to The Irish Times as “a little bit strange”. He also confirmed the details above about Fr Maloney.

He said that in 2001, two Dublin brothers made allegations about abuse by Fr Carragher and attempts were made to have the priest extradited to Ireland to face charges.

These were frustrated as there is no extradition treaty between Ireland and Canada and a medical report stated that Fr Carragher was too ill to travel.
Fr Carragher subsequently admitted the abuse of the brothers when they initiated a civil action against him in Canada. It is understood that they also received compensation.

Altogether Fr Carragher was accused by four men, including Mr Healy, of abusing them when he was in Dublin.

Mr Healy said he was “nine and 10 at the time and in the junior school. Fr Maloney abused me when I was 11 and in the first year at senior school.”

He said he asked Fr Starken for information on the two priests against whom he had made allegations.

“Information was provided about Fr Henry Maloney, but no information was forthcoming on Fr Carragher . . . No files on Fr Arthur Carragher were forthcoming until I provided information to Archbishop Diarmuid Martin.” The archbishop had been helpful to him, he said.

Fr Starken told The Irish Times that their “first inkling in relation to another case [Mr Healy’s] was early in 2007” when relevant information was “all forwarded to gardaí in accordance with normal procedure”.

Asked if Fr Carragher had any criminal convictions for child abuse, he said “no” and that “there were no allegations against him in Canada” arising from his years there.

According to a local Spiritans magazine, Fr Carragher, despite his earlier admissions of his abuse of two Dublin brothers beforehand, continued in ministry at Hamilton, Ontario, in 2004. In August 2005 he was congratulated on serving 55 years in ministry.

There have been no allegations brought against Fr Maloney or Fr Carragher arising from their years of ministry in Sierra Leone.
Appendix 4

CHILD SEXUAL ABUSE - Framework for a Church Response

The Effects of Child Sexual Abuse

21

The negative impact of sexual abuse on children should never be underestimated or minimised. Such abuse has the potential to affect the child victim physically, emotionally and spiritually, both in the short and long term. As well as the possibility of direct physical effects from the abuse itself, confusion can be created in the child victim about sexual norms and standards, leading to blurring of role boundaries. The child’s emotional well-being may also be affected, whereby feelings of guilt and shame are engendered in the child, leading to a loss of a sense of self-worth, to a development of a low self-esteem and to an impaired ability to trust. Awareness and acknowledgement, at an early stage, that a child has been abused allows for appropriate intervention to help the child victim deal with the abuse experience.

If a child’s abuse is not revealed and if appropriate help is not provided, the effects of that abuse can be long-lasting and can contribute to a variety of difficulties in adult life, including emotional, relationship and sexual problems. Even in adulthood, victims may feel stigmatised by having been abused in childhood. They may experience a deep sense of isolation. While needing the care and support of others, they may feel unable to reveal the fact that they have been abused even to close family or friends, fearing that their revelations may be disbelieved or not met with understanding.

A particular effect of abuse by a priest or religious is the harm which may be done to the person’s religious faith. The shattering of trust by a priest or religious who abuses may destroy the person’s trust in the Church and confidence in its ministers. Distrust of priests may result in the experiencing of significant difficulties in participating in the Eucharist and receiving the other sacraments. Indeed, the victim may feel unable to continue to be a member of the Church. Abuse may even damage or destroy belief in God.

---

Appendix 5

Towards Healing – (http://www.cori.ie/faoiseamh)

Towards Healing is an organisation which provides telephone counselling as well as a counselling and psychotherapy referral service for people who have suffered physical, emotional or sexual abuse when they were children, by persons working for the Catholic Church in Ireland.

If you have suffered in this way, Towards Healing will provide services to you no matter where you are currently living.

Towards Healing is a new Counselling and Support Service for survivors of Clerical and Religious abuse, funded by the Catholic Church.

It replaces the Faoiseamh Counselling Service which has been in operation since 1997, and which has provided face-to-face counselling to over 4,000 persons during that time, as well as Helpline Support to over 15000 survivors of Clerical and Religious Abuse.

The services provided by Towards Healing will be developed in consultation with representatives of Survivors, and will include healing meetings, groupwork, practical workshops and a bridging service designed to link clients to services relevant to their needs.

Towards Healing - Click to visit the website : www.towardshealing.ie

Freephone 1800 303416 (Rep. of Ireland)

Freephone 0800 0963315 (Northern Ireland and UK)

Member Congregations

LIST OF CONFERENCE MEMBERS

ALEXIAN BROTHERS
AUGUSTINIANS
BENEDICTINES (male)
BENEDICTINES (female)
BLESSED SACRAMENT SISTERS
BON SAUVEUR
BON SECOURS OF PARIS
BRIGIDINES
BROTHERS OF CHARITY
CHARITY (Daughters of Charity)
RELIGIOUS SISTERS OF CHARITY
SISTERS OF CHARITY OF JESUS AND MARY
SISTERS OF CHARITY OF NEVERS
SISTERS OF CHARITY OF OUR LADY MOTHER OF MERCY
MARIE AUXILIATRICE (Sisters of)
MARIE REPARATRICE (Sisters of)
MARIST SISTERS
MEDICAL MISSIONARIES OF MARY
MERCY SISTERS
MERCY (Northern Province)
MERCY (South Central Province)
MERCY (Southern Province)
MERCY (Western Province)
MISSIONARY SISTERS OF OUR LADY OF THE OLA APOSTLES
MISSIONARY SISTERS OF ST. COLUMBAN
MISSIONARY SISTERS OF THE ASSUMPTION MSA
MISSIONARY SISTERS OF THE HOLY ROSARY
MISSIONARY SISTERS (Servants of the Holy Spirit)
NORBERTINES
NAZARETH (Sisters)
OBLATES OF MARY IMMACULATE
OUR LADY OF THE CENACLE
OUR LADY OF SION
PALLOTTINE
PASSIONISTS PATRICIAN BROTHERS
PRESENTATION BROTHERS
POOR SERVANTS OF THE MOTHER OF GOD
PRESENTATION SISTERS
PRESENTATION SISTERS (Northern Province)
PRESENTATION SISTERS (South East province)
PRESENTATION SISTERS (South West Province)
REDEMPTORISTS
ROSMINIANS
RELIGIOUS OF CHRISTIAN EDUCATION
RELIGIOUS OF JESUS AND MARY
RELIGIOUS OF THE SACRED HEART OF MARY
SACRED HEARTS (Congregation of)
SACRED HEART FATHERS
SALESIANS OF DON BOSCO
SERVITES
SOCIETY OF ST. PAUL
SOCIETY OF THE DIVINE SAVIOUR THE SALVATORIANS
ST. JOHN OF GOD (Hospitaller Order)
SACRED HEARTS OF JESUS AND MARY
SACRED HEART SISTERS
SALESIAN SISTERS
SOCIETY OF THE HOLY CHILD JESUS
SOCIETY OF THE SACRED HEART
ST. CLARE (Sisters of)
ST. JOHN OF GOD SISTERS
ST. JOSEPH OF ANNECY (Sisters of)
ST. JOSEPH OF THE APPARITION (Sisters of)
ST. JOSEPH OF CLUNY (Sisters of)
ST. LOUIS (Sisters of)
ST. PAUL OF CHARTRES (Sisters of)
URSULINES OF JESUS
URSULINES OF THE IRISH UNION
VINCENTIANS
Appendix 6

Towards Healing unveils report

irishtimes.com - Last Updated: Tuesday, June 19, 2012, 16:19

Home – Ireland – >>

PATSY McGARRY, Religious Affairs Correspondent Irish Times

The Catholic Church-funded counselling and support service for survivors of abuse, Towards Healing, published its first annual report today.

In 2011, the service provided 28,079 face-to-face counselling sessions to over 1,300 survivors at an average cost of €70 per session.

Its helpline responded to almost 12,000 calls between February - when it was set up - and December of last year.

Of those who had contacted the service in 2011, about 80 per cent have been people who were in institutions as children, while 20 per cent would have been in a parish/diocesan context.

Over the year it provided counselling to 994 people worldwide, 80 per cent of whom were in the Republic of Ireland. A further 13 per cent were in the United Kingdom, with 4 per cent in Northern Ireland and 3 per cent in other countries. On average in 2011, about 30 new survivors registered with it each month.
Towards Healing has a "no waiting" policy and is free irrespective of a survivor’s current place or country of residence. “Once a client registers with Towards Healing they will be in direct contact with a therapist within days,” agency chairman James Nugent SC has said.

It was “the real strength of our service”, clinical director Dr Melissa Dermody said, adding it is “available to anyone who [as a minor] was physically, sexually, or emotionally abused by a member of the Catholic Church or in its care” in Ireland. This included women who were in Magdalene Laundries, Dr Dermody said.

To date, Towards Healing had assisted people on all continents, Mr Nugent told The Irish Times this afternoon. However, he pointed out the great majority of those who contacted the agency live in Ireland and the United Kingdom, although others are in the United States, Canada, Australia, continental Europe, with some in China and South America.

Chief executive Michael Lyons said although 4,470 people had availed of such services provided by the Catholic Church in Ireland since 1996, there were “significant indications” that many more had not availed of them yet. He noted, for example, that of those who had been in residential institutions run by religious congregations as children, some 15,000 had applied to the Redress Board.

Mr Nugent, Dr Dermody, and Mr Lyons were speaking this afternoon as Towards Healing published its first annual report. The service was established in February of 2011 as a more comprehensive alternative to the Faoiseamh service set up by the Sisters of Mercy in 1996.

That followed the RTÉ Dear Daughter documentary that dealt with events at the Goldenbridge orphanage in Dublin as recalled by Christine Buckley.

Faoiseamh provided a helpline and face-to-face counselling for about 25 per cent of those who used its helpline. Total funding by the Church for the Faoiseamh service came to €22 million from religious congregations and dioceses.

Towards Healing has continued those services but also provides "self-help" meetings, a "friendly phone call service" to keep contact with people and an advocacy service to help survivor’s access entitlements. It also provides a restorative-justice service for those who may need to meet their abuser as part of the healing process.
It is funded by the Catholic bishops, the Conference of Religious of Ireland, and the Irish Missionary Union. They provided it with €2.8 million last year.

However, it is an independent confidential service that is delivered by lay independent counsellors and psychotherapists. To date its work has involved 700 therapists.

While its clients are entitled to receive as many as 80 counselling sessions the majority do not exceed 40. For those who feel they may need more than 60 sessions there is an independent review mechanism that will determine whether this is the case. To date about 6 per cent of clients required counselling beyond the norm.

Of those who have availed of its services in 2011, 51 per cent are female with 49 per cent male. Those services are not just available to survivors, who made up 74 per cent of those who did avail of them. A further 16 per cent were survivor children, 8 per cent were survivor partners, 2 per cent were parents of survivors and 1 per cent were siblings of survivors.

The Towards Healing helpline is available at 1800 303 416 from the Republic of Ireland or at 0800 0963315 from Northern Ireland and the United Kingdom. It operates on Mondays and Wednesdays from 11am to 8pm and on Fridays from 11am to 4pm.

The service can be emailed casemanager@towardshealing.ie and its website is towardshealing.ie
Appendix 7

Recommendations on issuing a Notice of an NBSCCCI audit

From: Mark Vincent Healy [Gmail] [mailto:markvhealy@gmail.com]
Sent: 12 April 2012 11:08
To: 'David Harvey President Blackrock PPU'
Cc: 'Brian O'Sullivan VP Blackrock PPU'
Subject: 120412 - Spiritans' audit of sex abuse publication and widest circulation - Blackrock College
Importance: High

PRIVATE & CONFIDENTIAL  FAO

PPU President, Mr. David Harvey
PPU Vice-President, Mr. Brian O’Sullivan

This notice was sent to:

PPU President, Mr. Stephen Tracey (St. Mary’s)
PPU President, Mr. Paul Marren (Rockwell)
PPU President, Mr. David Harvey (Blackrock)
PPU President, Mr. James Muldowney (St. Michael’s)
PPU President, Mr. Stephen Moore (Templeogue)

Dear David and Brian and PPU members,

Following earlier correspondence on the notice of the NBSCCCI audit of the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp., I wished to clarify my request for assistance from the Past Pupils’ Union of Blackrock College.

In order to ensure the widest possible publication of the ‘request for review’ by Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. so that victims of child sexual abuse are given opportunity to contribute and be involved in the process I would ask that consideration is given to the following:

- Please ensure to use the name of the congregation as the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. in all information relating to this NBSCCCI audit
- Please make a notice of the NBSCCCI audit of the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. prominently on the PPU web site
- Please ensure such PPU notice is linked through to the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. web site notice [http://www.spiritan.ie/?p=375](http://www.spiritan.ie/?p=375)
- Please place a warning to PPU members not to enter any comment on the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. web site ([www.spiritan.ie](http://www.spiritan.ie)) as the comment box provided with the notice is not being used to publish visitor’s comments but is being used to gather information
- Please ensure notice of the NBSCCCI audit is circulated to all the PPU membership
• Please request that for each year represented by the PPU membership that those PPU members might commit to ensuring they will endeavour to forward such information to their former classmates

• Please ensure to contact and confer with all PPUs: Blackrock College, (www.rockunion.ie), Rockwell College, (www.rockwellunion.com), St Michael’s College, (www.smcu.ie), St Mary’s College, (www.stmarysppu.com) and Templeogue College, (www.ppu.ie)

• Please include the contact details for Mr. Ian Elliott, CEO, National Board for Safeguarding Children is prominently displayed and included in any PPU notification concerning this audit, a first of its kind in Ireland or anywhere else:

  Mr. Ian Elliott  
  Chief Executive Officer  
  National Board for Safeguarding Children in the Catholic Church  
  New House  
  St Patrick's College  
  Maynooth  
  Co. Kildare  
  Ireland  
  T : 00 353 (01) 5053018  F: 00 353 (01) 5053026  
  E. mail : ian.elliott@safeguarding.ie

• Please include the contact details for An Garda Síochána is prominently displayed and included in any PPU notification concerning this audit, a first of its kind in Ireland or anywhere else:

  Detective Inspector Declan Daly,  
  Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault Investigation Unit  
  Garda Headquarters,  
  Harcourt Street,  
  Dublin 2.  
  Ireland  
  T : 00 353 (01) 6663384  
  E. mail : declan.daly@garda.ie

• Please consider to include my contact details and comments published in the Irish Times ("Abuse victim welcomes notice of audit by Spiritans") in offering my support in any PPU notification concerning this audit, a first of its kind in Ireland or anywhere else:

  Mark Vincent Healy,  
  19 Temple Place,  
  Grenville Street,  
  Dublin 1,  
  Ireland  
  T : 00 353 87 6374006  
  E. mail : markvhealy@gamil.com
• Please consider what action will be taken by the PPU to support those who come forward and directing any who do to relevant services in consideration of their welfare relating to this matter. One In Four, Faoiseamh, etc. or other services available in the contributor’s location.

• Please consider how all five colleges might be involved in this notice of the NBSCCCI audit and assurances given to support all concerns raised so that the Child Safeguarding Policy moving forward is as robust as possible to ensure the highest standards are applied in child safety. Blackrock College, (www.blackrockcollege.com), Rockwell College, (www.rockwellcollege.ie), St Michael’s College, (www.stmichaelscollege.com), St Mary’s College, (www.stmarys.ie), and Templeogue College, (www.templeoguecollege.ie).

I am sure there will be other concerns raised at the relevant PPU Executive Committee meetings but I hope consideration will be given to these points raised with you.

I am following up on notice to others affected by members of the Holy Ghost Fathers (Spiritans) C.S.Sp. from overseas and I would ask that you are mindful of the distress caused to the children of others nations by members of the congregation.

This is a mammoth task to try raise awareness of the NBSCCCI audit so survivors and their families may be given opportunity to be heard and contribute to a meaningful outcome.

I would also hope that follow up on the release of the audit will be published widely also. Thank you and all for your assistance in publicising this NBSCCCI audit.

Yours sincerely,

Mark Vincent Healy

Related links:

Spiritans (Holy Ghost Fathers) Ireland web service NOTICE: http://www.spiritan.ie/?p=375

Irish Times Newspaper:

5 April 2012 – “Spiritans' audit of sex abuse”
2 April 2012 – “Spiritans religious order to be audited on sex abuse”
31 March 2012 – “Abuse victim welcomes notice of audit by Spiritans”
3 June 2011 – “Religious order denies claim by abuse victim”
20 March 2009 – “Priest gets suspended term for sex assaults on students”
Appendix 8
VIVAT International

Vision

Sharing a vision of the world and of every human being as created in goodness and dignity, and believing in the equality in rights and in dignity of all individuals, peoples and cultures, we commit ourselves to promote justice, harmony and reconciliation in the world. We therefore aim to:

Reach out to persons and peoples living in poverty of any kind, and share in their efforts for a restoration of well-being, dignity, and freedom.

Promote human rights, sustainable development, understanding and harmony between peoples, cultures, classes, and religions, and the creation of a world society and of local communities that permit the participation of all.

Work for ecological sustainability, the protection of biodiversity, and the preservation of the richness of the planet for future generations.